

The City of Seattle

## Pioneer Square Preservation Board

Mailing Address: PO Box 94649, Seattle WA 98124-4649 Street Address: 600 4th Avenue, 4th Floor

PSB 123/20

## Staff REPORT

For Board meeting August 19, 2020

Board Members Please Note: The citations from the District Ordinance, Rules for the Pioneer Square Preservation District, and Secretary of the Interior's Standards listed below are for your consideration in addition to any other citations you find relevant in considering each application.

081920.21 <u>Maud Building</u>

311 1st Ave S

Window replacement

## Staff report:

This is now an application for replacement of the windows after the fact. ARC previously reviewed and application for replacement of the windows Nov 13, 2019. ARC indicated that the applicant needed to show better documentation of the condition of the windows including larger photos as the extent of rot was not clear. Only a couple small areas of rot were visible in the photos provided which appeared repairable. No additional 3<sup>rd</sup> party assessment was provided.

The Board reviewed the proposal on Nov, 20, 2019. The applicant provided one enlarged photo of windows from the exterior and no additional information on window condition. The Board again said that the application did not include enough information to determine that the windows were beyond repair. They again instructed the applicant that if he thought that the windows were in worse condition than the couple areas of repair needed shown in the documentation provided, to provide the information that would be needed for the Board to confirm that the windows were beyond repair. The Board agreed that windows were significant features of a building and they could not approve the removal rather than repair of the windows based on what was provided. The gave the applicant the opportunity to table the application to provide more information before they voted on the application. The applicant chose to table the application.

"Printed on Recycled Paper"

Staff became aware that the windows had been replaced although a Certificate of Approval had not been issued, reported the noncompliance to SDCI who issued a Notice of Violation. A new application for window replacement after the fact was submitted. Additional photo documentation of the removed windows is provided.

The Secretary of Interiors Standards for rehabilitation says to repair before replacing. With the additional information, do you have enough information to determine that replacement rather than repair is necessary?

If so, The next consideration is if the windows that were installed are the appropriate windows for replacement. The Board has approved the aluminum clad on alley facades, taller buildings where access was an issue and where they were replacing non-original windows. This proposal is for both and alley and 1<sup>st</sup> Ave Façade, a short 3 story building and replacing original windows. The windows are similar but not replicating the original windows but do have the mini corbel details.

**Draft Motion for approval:** I move to recommend approval of a Certificate of Approval for replacing original windows because the windows were found to be beyond repair. The Board approves the aluminum clad wood windows after the fact installation.

The Board directs staff to prepare a written recommendation of approval based on considering the application submittal and Board discussion at the August 19, 2020 public meeting and forward this written recommendation to the Department of Neighborhoods Director.

**Code Citations:** 

SMC 23.66.030 Certificates of Approval required

Pioneer Square Preservation District Rules
III. GENERAL GUIDELINES FOR REHABILITATION AND NEW
CONSTRUCTION

In addition to the Pioneer Square Preservation District Ordinance and Rules, The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation with Guidelines for Rehabilitating\_Historic Buildings, and the complete series of Historic Buildings Preservation Briefs developed by the National Park Service shall serve as guidelines for proposed exterior alterations and treatments, rehabilitation projects, and new construction. (7/99)

Rehabilitation is defined as the act or process of making possible a compatible use for a property through repair, alterations, and additions while preserving those portions or features which convey its historical, cultural, or architectural values. (7/99) In considering rehabilitation projects, what is critical is the stabilization of significant historical detailing, respect for the original architectural style, and compatibility of scale and materials.

The following architectural elements are typical throughout the District and will be used by the Board in the evaluation of requests for design approval:

- A. <u>Building materials</u>. The most common facing materials are brick masonry and cut or rusticated sandstone, with limited use of terra cotta and tile. Wooden window sash, ornamental sheet metal, carved stone and wooden or cast iron storefronts are also typically used throughout the District. Synthetic stucco siding materials are generally not permitted. (7/99)
- B. <u>Color</u>. Building facades are primarily composed of varied tones of red brick masonry or gray sandstone. Unfinished brick, stone, or concrete masonry unit surfaces may not be painted. Painted color is typically applied to wooden window sash, sheet metal ornament and wooden or cast iron storefronts. Paint colors shall be appropriate to ensure compatibility within the District. (7/99)

## Secretary of Interior's Standards

- 2. The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.
- 5. Distinctive materials, features, finishes and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.
- 6. Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.
- New additions, exterior alterations or related new construction will not destroy
  historic materials, features and spatial relationships that characterize the
  property. The new work will be differentiated from the old and will be
  compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and
  massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.

2. New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

Guidelines for Windows **RECOMMENDED NOT RECOMMENDED Pages 102 – 109 of** STANDARDS FOR REHABILITATION & GUIDELINES FOR REHABILITATING HISTORIC BUILDINGS found in your Board resource books.

Preservation Brief 9 Repair of wooden windows Preservation Brief 16 substitute materials

Issued: August 12, 2020

Genna Nashem
Pioneer Square Preservation Board Coordinator